

Minutes

of a meeting of the

Planning Committee

held at the Council Chamber, Abbey House,
Abingdon on Wednesday, 7th November,
2012 at 6.30pm



Open to the public, including the press

Present:

Members: Councillors Robert Sharp (Chairman), John Morgan (Vice-Chair), John Woodford, Roger Cox, Anthony Hayward, Bob Johnston, Jerry Patterson, Margaret Turner, Eric Batts, Bill Jones, Sandy Lovatt and Helen Pighills.

Substitute Members: Councillor Jenny Hannaby (In place of Councillor Sue Marchant).

Other Members: Councillors Elaine Ware.

Officers: Susan Harbour, David Rothery, Martin Deans, Laura Hudson and Mike Gilbert.

Number of members of the public: 50

PI.103 CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The chairman gave housekeeping announcements, outlined the procedure and explained the remit of the committee.

He explained that the agenda would be heard in the order of the speakers' list.

PI.104 URGENT BUSINESS

None.

PI.105 NOTIFICATION OF SUBSTITUTES AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Councillor Sue Marchant had sent her apologies and Councillor Jenny Hannaby attended as her substitute.

PI.106 MINUTES

RESOLVED: to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 10 October 2012 as a correct record and to agree that the Chairman sign these as such.

PI.107 DECLARATIONS OF PECUNIARY INTERESTS AND OTHER DECLARATIONS

Declarations of pecuniary interest

None

Other declarations by councillors

Agenda Item	Councillors	Declaration
9	Jenny Hannaby	Member of Wantage Town Council and member of its planning committee
10	Roger Cox	Know Sarah Day, Chair Shrivenham Parish Council
11	Jerry Patterson	Is a member of CAMRA, one of the objectors to the application
12	Jerry Patterson, John Woodford, Bob Johnston	Know Brian Stops, Chair Cumnor Parish Council
13	Jenny Hannaby	Member of Wantage Town Council and of its planning committee.
	John Morgan	Member of Wantage Town Council
15	Eric Batts	On North Hinksey Parish Council, but has not taken part on discussions on this item.
	John Woodford	Knows the applicant
16	Jerry Patterson, John Woodford, Bob Johnston	Know Brian Stops, Chair Cumnor Parish Council

PI.108 STATEMENTS AND PETITIONS FROM THE PUBLIC ON PLANNING APPLICATIONS

The speakers' list for items on the agenda was tabled at the meeting.

PI.109 STATEMENTS, PETITIONS AND QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC ON OTHER MATTERS

None.

PI.110 MATERIALS

The committee considered the materials for the following application:

P12/V0324 Land at Townsend Road Shrivenham.

RESOLVED

To agree the following materials for the above site

External walls

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

Wednesday, 7th November, 2012

Main Brick – Ibstock Thakenham Re Multi
Detail brick - Ibstock Berkshire Orange
Atlas – Rustic Cotswold natural stone

External roofs

Redland Saxon 10” riven concrete interlocking tile - black
Redland DuoPlain interlocking concrete tile – rustic brown.

PI.111 LAND AT STOCKHAM FARM, DENCHWORTH ROAD, WANTAGE. P12/V1240/FUL

The officer presented his report on an application to build a residential development to provide 200 new homes across private and affordable tenures with public open space and play space, the protection of the existing route of the Wilts and Berks Canal and the provision of land to allow for a realigned route, on site car and cycle parking and improvements to site access and egress. Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and planning history are detailed in the officer’s report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Updates received since the report was published

The make up of the affordable properties will now be:

- 1 bedroom = 12 units (as per report)
- 2 bedroom = 43 units (as per report)
- 3 bedroom = 16 units (4 fewer than report)
- 4 bedroom = 9 units (4 more than report)

(these have been agreed with the Council’s affordable housing team)

Councillor June Stock, representing Grove Parish Council, spoke objecting to some aspects of the application: the parish council is concerned about traffic and schooling.

Mrs K Goodchild, Paul Dunwoody and Norman Spooner, local residents, spoke objecting to the application.

Andrew Wagstaff (Dandara), the applicant’s agent, spoke in favour of the application.

Further to questions from the committee to officers, it was confirmed that:

- The 2.5 storey buildings were now set away from Denchworth Road and that there would be a significant landscape buffer
- The drainage issues would be addressed by attenuation chambers and ponds to take rainwater discharge, not the canal

RESOLVED (for 12; against 0; abstentions 1)

To authorise the head of planning, in consultation with the committee chairman, to grant planning permission subject to:

1. The prior completion of a section 106 agreement within a deadline of three months to cater for on-site affordable housing provision, contributions toward off-site facilities and

services including highway works, education improvements, waste management and collection, street names signs, public art, library and museum services, social and health care, fire and rescue, police equipment, canal restoration measures, recreational and community facility improvements;

2. Landscaping provision, especially Denchworth Road area to be covered by Grampian style worded condition to ensure planting scheme in place before can commence on site
3. The following conditions, including the requirement to commence development within 12 months of the date of this committee consideration to help address the immediate housing land shortfall:
 - i. Commencement ONE YEAR ONLY - from date of planning committee
 - ii. Planning condition listing the approved drawings
 - iii. Materials as on plan replaced by materials on site to come to panel
 - iv. Withdraw permitted development rights (Part 1 Class A) - no extension/alteration to certain units specified
 - v. Refuse bin storage
 - vi. LS1 - landscaping scheme (submission)
 - vii. LS2 - landscaping scheme (implement)
 - viii. RE6 - boundary walls & fences
 - ix. Plot curtilage boundaries
 - x. Protect and retain hedges during development operations
 - xi. LS4 - tree protection (detailed)
 - xii. HY2 - access in accordance with specified plan (F)
 - xiii. HY8 car parking spaces
 - xiv. HY12 new estate roads
 - xv. HY13 estate roads prior to occupation of dwellings
 - xvi. HY20 bicycle parking
 - xvii. Sustainable travel information pack
 - xviii. MC32 - construction traffic management plan
 - xix. Flood risk details
 - xx. MC24 - sustainable drainage details (surface and foul)
 - xxi. Bats and newts
 - xxii. Land contamination
 - xxiii. Maintenance of open space areas and provision of play equipment on site
 - xxiv. RE17 - Slab levels and dwelling heights
 - xxv. Roof top ariels
 - xxvi. Canal engineering details

PI.112 LAND NEAR TO SHRIVENHAM FOOTBALL CLUB, HIGHWORTH ROAD, SHRIVENHAM. P12/V1635FUL

The officer presented his report on an application to erect 36 dwellings (comprising 10 open market, 12 for the over 55s age range and 14 affordable dwellings) with landscaping and associated infrastructure.

Updates to the report

The gate to the over 55s' area has now been removed from the plans.

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

Wednesday, 7th November, 2012

PI.4

Agenda paragraph 3.3 refers to a holding objection from county highways. This has now been removed and county highways are happy to approve, subject to conditions.

Agenda paragraph 6.12 refers to an area of 350 m, and should read 350 m².

Councillor Sarah Day, Chair/man of Shrevenham Parish Council, spoke in favour of the application.

Mrs Pamela Berridge, a local resident, spoke in favour of the application.

Councillor Elaine Ware, one of the ward councillors, read a statement on behalf of herself and Councillor Simon Howell, the other ward councillor. This was in favour of the application.

The committee considered this application.

The committee voted on the officer's recommendation to refuse the application.

RESOLVED (for 8; against 0; abstentions 5)

To refuse planning permission for the following reasons:

1 UNIQUE - Policy and landscape character

The proposed residential development of 36 dwelling units is contrary to the Council's general planning policy which requires:

i) that so far as possible future development should in the main be concentrated in established settlements as this is considered in the best interests of the public from the point of view of economy in the provision of services of all kinds and in land use, the preservation of rural amenities and the conservation of agricultural land and because it is only in this way that balanced communities can be achieved.

ii) that in rural areas development is only likely to be permitted within the approved limits of development of specified villages and within the village envelope of other villages where such envelope is limited and well defined and where there is no valid planning objection.

iii) the site lies within a countryside area and having regard to the unsatisfactory nature of the proposal such as in plot relationships and provision of screening enclosures to the site created would lead to a progressive detraction by this arbitrary intrusion into the rural character of the area and would therefore be detrimental to the visual amenity of the area, the rural landscape and to the general amenities of the locality.

iv) no overriding local need or special circumstances exist, including the present shortfall in housing land allocation provision, to warrant any departure from the planning policies of the Local Planning Authority.

The proposal is therefore contrary to Policies GS1, GS2, H11, H13, DC1, DC6, NE4, and NE9, of the local plan and paragraphs 14, 34, 37, 47, 49, 50, 57, 60, 61, 109, 111 and 115 of the NPPF.

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

Wednesday, 7th November, 2012

2 UNIQUE - Lack of information - Highways

The proposed layout of the part of the development serving the 12 retirement dwellings for occupiers over 55 years of age does not meet the standards for adoption for residential roads (including parking provision, turning heads, manoeuvrability and access for servicing, deliveries and emergency vehicles) and would lead to a substandard provision therefore the proposal is contrary to Policies DC1, DC5, and DC7 of the local plan.

3 UNIQUE - Refusal Reason lack of 106

The proposed development would generate the requirement for contributions both on site for affordable housing and off-site for highway works, education, social service, leisure and arts, waste management and towards police services, which have not been entered into. Without such provision the proposal would be unacceptable. The lack of this requirement is contrary to policy DC8 of the local plan and paragraphs 203 to 206 of the NPPF.

PI.113 THE ANCHOR, 1 HIGH STREET, STANFORD IN THE VALE. P12/V0291/COU

The officer presented her report on an application to change the use of this property from a public house (A4) with ancillary residential accommodation to a dwelling (C3) (without building work). Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and planning history are detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Updates from the report

- Three additional letters of objection raising the same issues as before and one additional letter stating no objections.
- Letter circulated to members questioning the contents of the submitted expert reports. The officer confirmed that a response on this letter had been requested from the applicants' consultant and also the Council consultant and both confirmed that the issues raised, including the date of the pubs closure being January 2012 and not January 2011, did not affect their conclusions.

Peter Lewis, from Stanford in the Vale Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Chris Marshall, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Tara Preston, the applicant, spoke in favour of the application.

Councillor Robert Sharp, the ward councillor, acknowledged the objectors' concerns but, given all the relevant facts, spoke in favour of the application for a change of use.

The committee considered this application.

RESOLVED (for 9; against 0; abstentions 4)

To grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:

1. TL1 – Time limit

2. List of approved plans
3. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, full details of any proposed external alterations to the building shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall only be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
4. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, full details of the proposed parking area shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall only be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

PI.114 136 CUMNOR HILL, CUMNOR. P12/V1192/FUL

The officer presented his report on an application to demolish existing flats; erect 3 x 1 bed and 4 x 2 bed flats, and to provide 12 parking spaces, refuse store and cycle store.

Updates to the report

This application is subject to amended plans which are currently out to consultation: the consultation period had not yet expired. The amended plans reduce the original application by one flat as a response to criticisms from the architects' panel.

Councillor Reverent Brian Stopps, Chair/man of Cumnor Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Ann Jefferson, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Henry Venners, the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application.

Councillor John Woodford, a ward member, spoke in favour of the application

The committee considered this application.

The committee voted on the officer's recommendation to refuse the application.

RESOLVED (for 13; against 0; abstentions 0)

To authorise the head of planning, in consultation with the chairman and vice-chairman, to grant planning permission; subject to no additional issues being raised following expiry of the consultation on the amended plans and also subject to the following conditions:

1. TL1 - time limit
2. List of approved drawings
3. MC2 - samples of materials
4. RE7 - boundary details
5. RE17 - slab levels
6. RE22 – window sill height
7. RE29 - refuse storage
8. HY6 - access parking and turning
9. HY20 - bicycle parking
10. LS5 - retain hedgerow
11. MC24 – surface water drainage details

12. No occupation or use of the development shall take place until the off-site improvements to the local sewer network have been completed
13. Add 2 m high fence at end of garden to protect rear neighbour's privacy.

Prior to the commencement of development, details of the construction of the foundations of the bicycle store shall be submitted to, and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The bicycle store shall be constructed in accordance with the approved details.

Councillor Jerry Patterson left the meeting.

PI.115 42 MARKET PLACE, WANTAGE. P12/V1214/FUL

The officer introduced her report on an application to erect a part 2 storey part 3 storey extension to the rear to accommodate 6 residential units comprising five flats and one town house, and associated landscaping works, cycle parking and service bay (as amended by agent's letter received 18.09.2012).

David Whittington, the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application.

John Morgan, the ward member, spoke objecting to the application.

The committee considered this application.

RESOLVED (for 11; against 1; abstentions 0)

To grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:

1. TL1 - Time limit
1. Planning condition listing the approved drawings
2. Material samples
3. MC9 – Building details
4. RE6 – Boundary treatment
5. MC24 – Drainage details
6. MC29 – Sustainable drainage system
7. LS1 – Landscaping scheme (submission)
8. LS2 - Landscaping scheme (implement)
9. HY6 - Access, parking & turning in accordance with plan
10. HY20 – Bicycle parking details
11. Construction traffic management plan
12. Materials to blend with local area

PI.116 172 CUMNOR HILL, OXFORD. P12/V1428/HH

The officer introduced the report on the application to build a proposed two storey rear extension, additional window and new oriel bay window to side elevation.

John Pickles, a neighbour, spoke objecting to the application.

John Woodford, a ward member, spoke in favour of the application

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

Wednesday, 7th November, 2012

RESOLVED (for 12; against 0; abstentions 0)

To grant planning permission, subject to the following conditions:

1. TL1 - Time limit
2. Planning condition listing the approved drawings
3. RE1 - Matching materials
4. RE28 - Obscured glazing (opening)
5. RE24 - Rooflight sill height (extension)

PI.117 32 LIME ROAD, OXFORD. P12/V1520/HH

The officer introduced the report on an application for a new building comprising a games room, guest bedroom, home gym and en-suite.

Eric Batts, a ward member, raised concerns about the application.

RESOLVED (for 12; against 0; abstentions 0)

To grant planning permission, subject to the following conditions:

1. TL1 - Time limit
2. Planning condition listing the approved drawings
3. RE1 - Matching materials
4. RE12 - Ancillary accommodation
5. HY1 - Access (details not shown)
6. HY8 - Car parking spaces
7. HY19 - No drainage to highway
8. Remove permitted development rights

PI.118 57 CUMNOR HILL, OXFORD. P12/V2003/HH

The officer introduced the report for an application to construct a 2 storey side extension, a single storey front porch extension and to erect a detached garage.

Update to report

Cumnor Parish Council no longer object to the extensions, but remain concerned about the proposed garage and the affect on the street scene.

Councillor Reverend Brian Stopps, Chair/man of Cumnor Parish Council spoke in objection to the proposed garage.

John Woodford, a ward member, spoke in favour of the application.

RESOLVED (for 12; against 0; abstentions 0)

To grant planning permission, subject to the following conditions:

- 1 : TL1 - Time limit

- 2 : MC3 - Materials in accordance with application
- 3 : RE11 - Garage accommodation
- 4 : HY6 - Access, parking & turning in accordance with plan
- 5 : HY19 - No drainage to highway
- 6 : Planning condition listing the approved drawings

**PI.119 5 HOBBYHORSE LANE, SUTTON COURTENAY.
P12/V0615/ZZZ**

The officer introduced the report for a partially retrospective application to convert part of outbuildings to a granny annexe.

RESOLVED (for 12; against 0; to 0)

To authorise the head of planning, in consultation with the chairman and vice chairman of the planning committee, to grant planning permission; subject to the completion of a legal agreement tying the use of the ancillary accommodation to the main house and also subject to the following conditions:

- 1 : Planning condition listing the approved drawings
- 2 : RE1 - Matching materials
- 3 : RE12 - Ancillary accommodation

The meeting closed at 10.40 pm